

## FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

## 2019-2021

## DSABLED PEOPLE'S ORGANIZATION OF BHUTAN Thimphu Bhutan

Prepared by Ugyen Samdrup, Individual Consultant

#### Preface

This Final Evaluation focuses on the Organizational Development for the Sustainability of Normisjon, a project implemented in Bhutan by the Disabled Persons Association of Bhutan.

The DPAB wishes to express its gratitude to Mr. Ugyen Samdrup, Consultant, for conducting an exhaustive final review. The management wishes to express its gratitude to the several individuals who contributed to this report and to recognise those who took the time to meet with us during the focus group discussion, despite numerous conflicting and frequently urgent requests. Additionally, we wish to express our gratitude to the DPAB employees for their time and insight. They considerably facilitated our efforts. We value and cherish the atmosphere of candour and constructive interaction that pervades all of our sessions. Many thanks to everyone who took the time and provided great information during the interviews.

We believe that this evaluation will shed light on the operations and efficacy of the DPAB's 'Organisational Development for Sustainability' initiative.

Sonam Gyamtsho Executive Director

## **Glossary of Acronyms**

DPAB	Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan
DPO	Persons with disabilities's Organization
DPOB	Persons with disabilities's Organization of Bhutan
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
LG	Local Government
MoE	Ministry of Education
MoH	Ministry of Health
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
ODS	Organizational Development for Sustainability
PWD	Persons with Disabilities
РНСВ	Population and Housing Census of Bhutan
RGoB	Royal Government of Bhutan
SEN	Special Education Needs
UN	United Nations

UNCRPD: United Nations Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities

## **Table of Contents**

G	lossary	of Acronyms	.2
E	xecutiv	e Summary	.4
1	. Intr	oduction	.8
	1.1	Background of the project	.8
	1.2	Description of the evaluation	12
	1.3	Methodology	13
2	. Pres	sentation of findings	13
	2.1.	Overall project design	
	1.4	Project activities	
	1.5	Project management and administration	
	1.6	Empowerment assessment	
	1.7	Sustainability Assessment	27
3	. Less	ons learned	30
4	. Rec	ommendations	31
5	. List	of References	33
6	. Ann	exures	34
	Annex	ure I: Project Activity Result	34
	Annex	ure II: Terms of Reference (TOR)	39

#### **Executive Summary**

The **Organizational Development for Sustainability** (ODS) is a Normisjon funded project implemented in Bhutan by Disabled Persons Association of Bhutan. The Normisjon granted initial five-year project titled 'Organizational Development Project' to the DPAB for the period 2014-2018. The project made significant impact in the areas of advocacy, empowerment and rehabilitation, networking, organizational capacity, and registration of PWDs. The Normisjon graciously extended the project by another 3 years i.e., 2019 - 2021 with project titled 'Organizational Development for Sustainability: 3 Year Phase-out Period'. With the three years extension, the project expects to make DPAB a financially sustained institution with a competent staff that promotes physical, psychological and socio-economic well-being of persons with disabilities through inclusion and empowerment. Specifically, the project aimed to strengthen the sustainability of DPAB, empower PWDs and improve the attitude of community and the society towards disability. The objective was expected to be achieved through following outcomes:

- **OUTCOME 1** Sustained DPAB as an institution
- **OUTCOME 2** Empowered Persons with Disabilities
- OUTCOME 3 Improved attitude and values of the society towards Persons with Disabilities

Final evaluation of Organizational Development for Sustainability presented in this document, was conducted with the purpose to conduct an unbiased, in-depth evaluation of programme results and outcomes in comparison to planned results, while also taking into account efficiency and its contribution to tangible results and outcomes; to establish a learning process that will provide valuable information to the DPAB in order to improve the effectiveness of future strategies and programmes; and to assess the project's level of performance and progress towards specified development goals. The methodology used in this evaluation was discussed and agreed with the DPAB management on the terms of reference (ToR). Main findings and conclusions of the final evaluation presented in the report are:

- Overall project design –The project's overall outcome, output, and activities have been determined to be consistent with and supportive of national and international aims and objectives. The initiative has been successful in achieving its objectives. The donor's timely funding release, the staff's core competencies, and the project's excellent teamwork and cooperation with stakeholders all contributed to the project's success despite the emergence of the COVID-19 pandemic. The project implementation team, beneficiaries, and stakeholders have benefited from the project's learning. As a result, the society's attitude and values for PWDs have generally improved.
- Project activities The project's activities had a significant impact on the country's PWDs situation. The project's awareness-raising and advocacy activities contributed to increasing public awareness and influenced over the plight of PWDs in Bhutan. The lobbying has resulted in the establishment of a national policy for individuals with disabilities, the creation of a disability-friendly environment, and the UN Bhutan's recognition of DPAB as the country's Persons with disabilities's Organization. Additionally, the project activities aided in the development of the organisation. The organisational capability is enhanced, the institutional identity is strengthened, and the public's attitude and values towards people with disabilities are improved. The project's empowerment and rehabilitation programme increased the livelihood and independence of those with disabilities in society. Skill development training enhanced individuals' abilities and increased career opportunities. PWDs were able to get medical care under the medical support programme. Additionally, the education support programme assisted PWDs in completing their formal education in Central Schools. Additionally, the project activities assisted DPAB in generating revenue and attracting funding from sponsors. The membership drive benefited DPAB by generating revenue, which is crucial for the organization's financial sustainability. DPAB now has a total membership of 2521. Additionally, DPAB obtained skill development projects from other institutions, including the Asian Development Bank, the United Nations in Bhutan, Austrian Development Agency, the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources, and Gross National Happiness Commission.
- *Project management and administration* The project was deemed to have been implemented in a transparent and efficient manner. The initiative was implemented with the assistance of volunteers by a small and compact team of DPAB. Monitoring and evaluation

were determined to have been carried out in accordance with the monitoring and evaluation plan outlined in the project document. The data flowchart was used to collect and preserve data by the project management team. The management has gathered data for the project's various indicators in order to validate the project's outcome and output. The programme aided in the learning of DPAB staff.

- *Empowerment assessment* On the empowerment front, the project has had a considerable impact. The project has made great success in five major subject areas: 1. Strengthening civil society; 2. Sustaining the DPAB as an institution; 3. Empowering PWDs;
   4. Improving the society's attitude and values towards PWDs, and 5. Gender equality.
- Sustainability assessment Sustainability was determined based on human resource and financial capacities. The report found that the initiative was successful in enhancing employees' capabilities and skills in a variety of critical areas for the organization's existence. The organisation currently has a well-trained workforce that is constantly prepared to carry out the mission of the organisation. Organizational sustainability, on the other hand, is debatable from a financial standpoint. DPAB was and continues to be a donor-supported organisation. DPAB will not be able to continue the project's programmes once the Normisjon's initiative ends. While the organisation may generate revenue through a membership fee donation drive, the revenue generated would be negligible in comparison to the organization's operational expenses. Thus, the sustainability of project initiatives is jeopardised until financing is provided or the government implements the programmes as part of the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities' policy implementation. Moreover, it is worth noting that the Gross National Happiness Commission has decided in principle to include the construction of the Resource Centre in the 13th Five-Year Plan. Government assistance for the resource centre's construction would have a profound effect on DPAB's sustainability.

**Main conclusions and recommendations** – The Organizational Development for Sustainability project is deemed pertinent and successfully implemented. In light of the organization's financial viability, it is recommended that DPAB suspend its empowerment and rehabilitation programmes and focus on financially sustainable activities until more money is found. The building of a resource centre

is identified as a promising future area of assistance for potential future donors since it would provide financial sustainability while also promoting the creation of disability-friendly structures in society.

#### 1. Introduction

The Final Evaluation Report is divided into three sections. The first section provides general background of the project, purpose of evaluation, and evaluation methodology. The next section dwells on findings from the reports and from interactions with stakeholders. The last section provides recommendations from the observations and findings in the context of project objectives.

#### 1.1 Background of the project

The **Organizational Development for Sustainability** (ODS) was implemented in Bhutan. The country is located in the eastern Himalayan folds, sandwiched between the two colossal countries of China (Tibet) to the north and India's Assam and West Bengal to the south, Arunachal Pradesh to the east, and Sikkim to the west. Bhutan covers an area of 38,394 square kilometres and is located between  $88^{\circ} 45'$  and  $92^{\circ}10'$  east longitude and  $26^{\circ}42'$  and  $28^{\circ}15'$  north latitude. Bhutan is predominantly mountainous, with the exception of a small flat strip in the southern foothills that experiences hot and humid summers. The central and northern valleys are separated by mountains reaching a height of 7,200 metres.

Bhutan continues to pursue equitable socioeconomic growth in accordance with the Gross National Happiness ideology. Its development policies and strategies are focused towards addressing the needs of all sections of society, particularly the underprivileged and vulnerable. The dedication to inclusive development is expressed in the Kingdom of Bhutan's Constitution. Article 7 Section 15 of the Constitution provides that 'All persons are equal before the law, are entitled to equal and effective protection of the law, and shall not be discriminated against on the basis of race, sex, language, religion, politics, or any other status.' Additionally, Section 22 of Article 9 of the Constitution stipulates, 'The State shall endeavour to provide security in the event of sickness and disability, or a lack of adequate means of livelihood for reasons beyond one's control'. Despite commendable efforts and socioeconomic progress, certain segments of society, including persons with disabilities, have been excluded from development benefits and opportunities for participation for a variety of reasons and continue to require targeted assistance from the Royal Government of Bhutan (RGoB). According to the 2017

Population and Housing Census of Bhutan (PHCB), Bhutan has a disability prevalence rate of 2.1% (15,567 persons) of which 47.90% (7456) persons are male and 52.10% (8111) are female, and 80% (12512) persons are in rural and 20% (3055) in urban. Individuals with disabilities frequently suffer considerable levels of prejudice and stigma on a daily basis, and as a result, many are invisible in society and are unable to participate fully in their communities and families. Additionally, women and girls with impairments face double discrimination.

Bhutan lacked adequate knowledge regarding disability requirements. There are a few ill-equipped schools in the country dedicated to children with disabilities. The majority of PWDs in Bhutan live in poverty and ignorance. Many PWDs live in seclusion in remote areas of the country. They do not have access to education or adequate support services. Additionally, individuals with disabilities are unable to utilise and access services due to their inaccessibility and affordability. It lacked rehabilitation programmes for individuals PWDs living in rural areas of the country. Bhutan has not yet ratified the UNCRPD, despite the fact that the country became a signatory in 2010. Additionally, the National Disability Act has not yet been implemented. Bhutan recently endorsed the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities in 2020. Policymakers and local leaders are unaware of the issues confronting PWDs. As a result, many individuals with disabilities are excluded from all major events, whether at the national or local level.

Above all, the current government provides no financial assistance to civil society organisations. Indeed, the space available to civil society organisations is dwindling. Traditionally, extended Bhutanese families have taken care of the PWDs' basic needs. However, as society's structure, family structure, rural-urban migration, and community bonding or vitality deteriorate, this support base is dwindling. As a result, individuals with disabilities face the double burden of self-sufficiency and competition for limited job openings in increasingly skilled labour markets. Additionally, thousands of people with disabilities lack access to high-quality education and other support services.

The Normisjon, a donor agency in Norway, implemented ODS program in Bhutan through Persons with disabilities's Organization of Bhutan (DPOB) erstwhile Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan (DPAB). DPAB was legally registered with the Civil Society Organizations Authority (CSOA) on 26 November 2010 under His Royal Highness Prince Namgyal Wangchuk, the XXVIth Paro

Penlop's patronage. With the vision of establishing an 'inclusive society that recognises, respects, and advocates for the rights and needs of all persons with disabilities in Bhutan'. DPAB seeks to 'promote the physical, psychological, and socioeconomic well-being of persons with disabilities through inclusion and empowerment.' The UN Office in Bhutan formally recognised DPAB as the DPO in Bhutan in 2020 and it is the country's only DPO with PWDs members on its Board of Directors, Technical Committee, and Management Team.

The DPAB is governed by a Board of Trustees, which is comprised of members elected by the membership for a fixed term of office. The DPAB Board of Directors is made up of seven non-technical members and fifteen technical members. Twenty-five Focal Persons (DT Secretaries in Dzongkhags) assist DPAB in updating data on PWDs in their respective districts, as well as assisting with coordination and communication at the Dzongkhag level as needed. The Association's operations are governed by its charter and articles of association, in accordance with the requirements of the 2007 Civil Society Organization Act of Bhutan.

The Normisjon granted initial project titled 'Organizational Development Project' to the DPAB for the period 2014-2018. A total of Nu.19615580.76 was released in different instalments. The project completed in the year 2018 making significant impact in the areas of advocacy, empowerment and rehabilitation, networking, organizational capacity, and registration of PWDs. The Normisjon, considering the impact of last the project and recognizing the need of financial assistance, graciously extended the project by another 3 years i.e., 2019 - 2021 with project titled 'Organizational Development for Sustainability: 3 Year Phase-out Period'. The new project expects to strengthen the sustainability of DPAB, empower PWDs and improve the attitude of community and the society towards disability. Project goals and components are as mentioned below:

#### Project Development Goal

DPAB is a financially sustained institution with a competent staff that promotes physical, psychological and socio-economic well-being of persons with disabilities through inclusion and empowerment.

#### **Project Objective**

**i.** DPAB is a sustainable institution.

- **ii.** People with disabilities are empowered.
- iii. Attitude and values of the society towards person with disabilities are improved.

#### Project Output

- i. Capacity of DPAB strengthened
- ii. Resource and coordination canter established for persons with disabilities
- iii. Membership developed to gain an income from membership fees.
- iv. Persons with disabilities are employed.
- v. Women and men with disabilities are trained on life skills.
- vi. Rehabilitation programmes at the community level strengthened
- vii. Society and persons with disabilities informed on the rights/needs of persons with disabilities.
- viii. Local government leaders trained on inclusiveness and Participation of persons with disabilities in development process.

The project title	Organizational Development for Sustainability
Project number	NORAD's Project No: QZA-12/0763-198
	Normisjon's Project No: 10764
Name of Implementing Partner	Disabled Person's Association of Bhutan (DPAB)
Name of Project Manager	Sonam Gyamtsho, Executive Director, DPAB

Address	JD Apartment
	Lower Motithang
	Thimphu 11001
Tel	+97517899209
Email	info@dpab.org.bt or sonamkgyamtsho@gmail.com
Project Period	January 2019- 2021(December)
The location of the project area (district / city / town / region).	In 20 Districts of Bhutan with head office in Thimphu
The overall budget of the project	Year 1= BTN 53,33,120.00
(local currency)	Year 2= BTN 53,83,120.00
	Year 3= BTN 47,135,20.00
	Total = BTN 15,429,760.00

#### **1.2** Description of the evaluation

This evaluation aims to shed light on the DPAB's 'Organisational Development for Sustainability' program's operations and effectiveness. The primary objective is to conduct an unbiased, in-depth evaluation of programme results and outcomes in comparison to planned results, while also taking into account efficiency and its contribution to tangible results and outcomes; to establish a learning

process that will provide valuable information to the DPAB in order to improve the effectiveness of future strategies and programmes; and to assess the project's level of performance and progress towards specified development goals.

#### 1.3 Methodology

The methodology used in this evaluation was discussed and agreed with the DPAB management on the terms of reference (ToR). During inception phase, a systematic review was done on secondary data sources, including background documents on the baseline report and documents related to the project. During inception phase, the theory of change approach and logical framework formed the basis for evaluation's overall methodology. Following an initial desk analysis of strategic project documents, progress reports and secondary sources, primary data was gathered through individual and group interviews with stakeholders (implementing partners, cooperating governmental/private institutions) and focus group discussion with project team and beneficiaries.

#### 2. Presentation of findings

#### 2.1.Overall project design

Q1. Have the outcomes, outputs and activities of the programme been consistent with the project strategy and the intended impacts of the project. Has the project achieved its desired outcomes? Has it contributed to change in people's lives?

The project goal was to make DPAB a financially sustained institution with a competent staff that promotes physical, psychological and socio-economic well-being of persons with disabilities through inclusion and empowerment. The activities, outputs and outcomes of was found consistent with the project strategy and national goals. The project is very relevant to Bhutan and its development philosophy of Gross National Happiness that aims to provide equitable socioeconomic growth. It is also in consonance to the constitution of kingdom of Bhutan. The Article 7 Section 15 of the Constitution provides that 'All persons are equal before the law, are entitled to equal and effective protection of the law, and shall not be discriminated against on the basis of race, sex, language, religion, politics, or any other status.' Additionally, Section 22 of Article 9 of the Constitution stipulates, 'The State shall endeavour to provide security in the event of

sickness and disability, or a lack of adequate means of livelihood for reasons beyond one's control'. The project activities are also in consistent with the sustainable development goals and National Policy for Persons with Disabilities.

The impact of the project was assessed based the theory of change and logical framework of the project document.

Figure	1:Projected	Theory	of	Change	(Project	Document)
v	evelopment Goal: DPA sychological and socioe	•		1	1	

ІМРАСТ	Sustained DPAB as an institution		Empowered PWDs	
	DPAB generates its own income. Government grants funds for activities related to disability issues in the country	<ul> <li>PWDs get gainful employment</li> <li>PWDs generate income for livelihood</li> </ul>		Improved Attitudes and Values of the Society towards PWDs
OUTCOME	Increased Contributing Members and DPAB officials become competent. Approved National Disability Policy.	PWDs become and Compete		Society become aware about the rights and needs of PWDs
STRATEGY	Development of Membership Base and Capacity Building of DPAB. Lobbying with the Government for the approval of National Disability Policy	Skill Develo	pment	Increase advocacy and awareness

**PROBLEM:** DPAB is fully donor driven DPO and is not financially and organizationally sustainable.

The project has three broad outcomes. Outcome 1: Sustained DPAB as an institution Outcome 2: Empowered Persons with disabilities and Outcome 3: Improved attitude and values of the society towards Persons with disabilities.

#### **OUTCOME 1:** Sustained DPAB as an institution

#### Output 1.1: Capacity of DPAB strengthened

DPAB could develop its personnel's capacity in a variety of areas. The training equipped DPAB staff with the ability to operate its office autonomously as an institution. Its employees will be capable of performing all administrative and project management functions.

Output 1.2: Membership developed to gain an income from membership fees

The effort aided DPAB in boosting awareness of the organization's requirements and resulted in the registration of a sizable number of contributing members. DPAB could register and raise funds through membership contribution that will be used to cover future operational costs.

#### Output 1.3: Resource centre built

The project has not made significant progress in this area. The project was able to produce an architectural drawing in conjunction with a business plan. However, the resource centre is yet to be constructed due to a lack of funds. The resource centre is critical to DPAB's sustainability since it will generate monthly revenue for the organisation, which will be used to cover operational costs.

#### **OUTCOME 2: Empowered Persons with Disabilities**

Output 2.1: Persons with disabilities are employed.

Individuals with disabilities continue to have a lower likelihood of finding work or starting a business than the general population. To safeguard the right of persons with disabilities to work and establish their own businesses on an equal footing with others, the project

supported employment opportunities for PWDs. This included the right to earn a living through work that is freely chosen or accepted in the labour market, as well as work in an open, inclusive, and accessible work environment. Certain PWDs were able to receive entrepreneurial training and eventually establish their own businesses.

Output 2.2: Rehabilitation programmes at the community level strengthened.

The rehabilitation programme has a tremendous impact on the lives of people with disabilities. PWDs received educational and medical help. Education is a fundamental socioeconomic human right for all children, especially those with impairments. Inadequate schooling continues to be a major cause of poverty and isolation of children with and without disabilities from larger societal issues. Inadequate education and marketable occupational training for children and adolescents with disabilities results in a lack of options for future personal development, increasing their marginalisation and vulnerability. It obstructs their access to jobs, other sources of income, and business development. Thus, the programme benefited 97 PWDs by enabling them to pursue formal education in central schools. Similarly, PWDs received medical assistance. Individuals with disabilities are frequently predisposed to secondary health problems as a result of their original handicap. The project recognised that individuals with disabilities had the right to the best feasible standard of health free of disability prejudice. Through the medical support programme, the project guaranteed that PWDs had access to medical services and care.

#### Output 2.3. Women and men with disabilities trained on life skills

Women and men with disabilities had the opportunity to participate in a variety of life skill training programmes, including tailoring, SPA, and business. Some PWDs were able to obtain employment opportunities as a result of life skill training, while others were able to start their own businesses. PWDs' lives have been transformed by the programme.

#### **OUTCOME 3:** Improved attitude and values of the society towards Persons with Disabilities

Output 3.1: Society and persons with disabilities informed on the rights/needs of persons with disabilities.

The project made significant strides in terms of advocacy and public awareness. The programme has the potential to educate all segments of society, including legislators, bureaucrats, local government officials, frontline workers, NGO groups, international organisations, educators, and students. The initiative is having a beneficial effect on how people see persons with disabilities. The public perception of those with disabilities has shifted.

Output 3.2: Local government leaders and health care workers trained on inclusiveness and participation of persons with disabilities in development process.

Local government leaders received thorough training on inclusive development and the inclusion of people with disabilities. Local leaders now understand the dynamics of PWDs and work with DPAB to empower and rehabilitate PWDs in their communities.

Output 3.3: UN and government adopt the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities

The project's most significant milestone is the endorsement of the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities. The policy acknowledges the needs and requirements of persons with disabilities and enshrines the government's commitment to fostering an equal and inclusive society for persons with disabilities. Additionally, the policy ensures the continuation of rehabilitation and empowerment initiatives following the conclusion of the project. The majority of the project's programmes are covered by policy in the form of policy interventions.

#### Q2: What are the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of project objectives?

Following factors influenced the implementation of the project.

- i. **Timely release of budget by donor:** Normisjon's timely disbursement of funds aided DPAB in initiating and completing project activities on schedule. The Donor's continuous assistance and advice aided the project in successful implementation of the project.
- **ii. Core competency of staff:** Moral values, team spirit and genuine interest to support influenced successful project implementation of the project. Despite the pandemic, DPAB demonstrated sufficient competence to complete the project without compromising the project's objectives.
- **iii. Collaboration and cooperation with stakeholders:** The strong support and cooperation from stakeholders and beneficiaries have made favourable for the project management to implement the project more efficient and effective manner. DPAB has received strong support from the government, LG leaders, UN body, NGOs, beneficiaries during the project period.
- **iv. COVID-19 pandemic:** Government's imposition of lockdowns and other restrictions adversely affected seamless implementation of the project. DPAB was could not carryout project activities as per the plan. However, DPAB managed to complete the activities using novel approaches.

#### Q3: Has the project contributed to learning?

The project has had a significant impact on DPAB employees, volunteers, interns, paliamentarians, bureaucrats, policymakers, local le aders, and the general public. As part of the project component, the employees got several capacity buildings such as proposal writing, accounting system, leadership, information and communication technology, office management, and so on. The programmes may have bolstered their abilities, which would be extremely beneficial to the organization's long-term viability and the empowerment of people with disabilities.

The initiative was certainly educational for the PWDs. A total of 96 PWDs were given the opportunity to attend the central schools and complete their formal education on a full scholarship. A total of 29 PWDs received life skills training. Entrepreneurship training was given to 45 people with disabilities over the course of a week. 40 PWDs have been able to start their own businesses and become self-employed as a result of the programme.

The advocacy programmes have increased public understanding of the needs and requirements of people with disabilities among legislators, bureaucrats, policymakers, local leaders, and the general public. The project has undoubtedly increased their awareness of PWDs and their predicament in Bhutan. When it comes to the needs of people with disabilities, society has become more sensitive and open. This is demonstrated by the society's significant recent initiatives. The government generously adopted the National Disability Policy following much sensitisation and campaigning.

It is critical that constructed environments incorporate universal design principles, are barrier-free, and are modified to meet the equal requirements of all individuals. Because the demands of persons with disabilities overlap with those of the majority, planning for the majority entails planning for people of varied abilities and disabilities. The UN Office in Bhutan has upgraded its facilities to make them more accessible to persons with disabilities.

Access to accessible public transportation is crucial for disabled individuals to engage fully in community life, education, employment, and the economy, and it can have a substantial impact on their quality of life. In Bhutan, public transportation is cited as a significant impediment to disability inclusion. Priority seating on city buses was established for PWDs, and the government purchased new buses equipped with priority seats. In each of its branch offices around the country, the Bank of Bhutan Limited has established a priority counter for PWD. These are real-world examples of lobbying and education having a positive effect.

A total of 37 (excludes 2021 data) volunteers were also involved indirectly in the project. Their awareness of the needs and wants of PWDs might have increased somewhat. The general public gained an understanding of PWDs, and individuals became contributing members of DPAB. As of 31<sup>st</sup> December 2021, DPAB has 2521 contributing members contributing minimum of Nu.10 each per month. This resulted in increased revenue generation for the company, though the amount may not be significant enough.

#### **1.4 Project activities**

Q4: To what extent has DPAB's awareness and advocacy efforts contributed to raise awareness and influence the situation of PWD in Bhutan?

It is of utmost importance for the society to know the rights and needs of PWDs. The DPAB was successful in raising awareness and advocating for many parts of the country's population. The project has reached out to a wide range of people, including parliamentarians, bureaucrats, local government officials, educators, students, people with disabilities, and the general public. Given the breadth of coverage and significance of the outcomes, it can be stated that the project's awareness and advocacy efforts aided in raising awareness and influencing the situation of PWD in Bhutan in the following areas.

**Enactment of policy:** The project's conclusion resulted in the government's ratification of the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities. The policy's aims are to empower persons with disabilities and to ensure their full participation in society and in the process of socioeconomic development on an equal footing; Disability initiatives should be integrated into all sectors' goals, policies, and activities. Enhance disabled individuals' access to opportunities and services; Enhance disabled individuals' and their families' socioeconomic status. Promoting healthy living among individuals with disabilities through participation in sports, recreation, and culture; Promoting a favourable attitude and behaviour towards people with disabilities in the general population. Policy shows government support for people with disabilities and assures hope for DPAB in getting government's support in rendering empowerment program once the project is over.

**Disability friendly environment:** The campaign resulted in the establishment of an enabling environment for PWDs to live independently. Offices became more accessible to persons with disabilities. For example, the UN office in Bhutan has been made disability-friendly by installing ramps for wheelchair users and accessible washrooms. PWDs have priority seating on public transportation (city bus). Bank of Bhutan Limited offers priority counters for PWDs at all branch offices.

**Recognition of DPAB**: The general public realized the role of DPAB in Bhutan. Thus, significant number of people came forward to become contributing member of DPAB. Further, UN office in Bhutan recognised DPAB as the Persons with disabilities's Organization in Bhutan in 2019. These are the living testimony of positive impact of extensive advocacy and awareness program of the project.

Q5: How has the project contributed to organizational development of DPAB?

The success of DPAB depends on its leadership, administrative efficiency, and collaboration. The project contributed to organization development in following ways:

**Organizational competency enhanced:** Through the project, DPAB was able to involve in project management and learn through trial and error. The project not only enhanced management skills but also developed special skills on project management. The project was directly engaged in the capacity building of DPAB staff. All employees of underwent various trainings that are vital for the organization to sustain as an institution. DPAB now has small, efficient, and competent staff ready to carry out any tasks. DPAB has only six employees with four of them being persons with disability. DPAB has relied on its internal resource to raise awareness and carry out training program for the stakeholders. DPAB has been able to successfully complete the project and also its mandates without any issue. This shows that the DPAB is organizationally grown as an institution.

**Institutional identity improved:** DPAB also succeeded in developing a social presence. UN Bhutan recognised DPAB as a Persons with disabilities's Organization, which will have a significant impact on the organization's long-term sustainability in terms of getting financial and technical support. Additionally, DPAB has partnered with a diverse range of stakeholders and development partners, securing essential support and learning from one another. Additionally, it facilitated the formation of institutional connections and networking.

**Society's attitude towards PWD shifted:** both government and society have begun to respect PWDs' rights and needs. Society has become more inclusive and accessible to people with disabilities. The government has supported a National Policy for Persons with Disabilities, and other disability-friendly initiatives have begun to emerge.

# Q6: To what extend the support and rehabilitation effort enhance livelihood and independence of persons with disabilities in the society.

The project's support and rehabilitation programme appear to have a substantial influence on PWDs, even though the number is not significant. 57 PWDs have benefited from the rehabilitation programme by receiving skill development training and becoming self-

employed. Through the medical support programme, PWDs were able to access medical care. 22 people with disabilities received medical assistance. 96 PWDs were allowed to continue their formal education in the Central Schools through the education support programme. As a result, the initiative enhanced and strengthened community-based rehabilitation programmes, ultimately increasing the independence of people with disabilities in society.

#### Q7: To what extent has DPAB managed to generate income and attract funding from other supporters and donors.

The project assisted the DPAB in initiating a campaign to collect membership fees. Members are vital to the development and sustainability of organisations following the conclusion of the project. Members contribute a range of knowledge and influence, as well as political support and volunteer time, as they come from diverse backgrounds and social statuses.

The DPAB is now comprised of 2521 members. Members of this group make a minimum monthly contribution of Nu.100. The organisation may be able to raise a small amount of money through a membership fee campaign, which may then be used to expand its financial leverage.

Additionally, DPAB was able to secure funds from other institutions such as the Asian Development Bank, the United Nations in Bhutan, and the Ministry of Labour and Human Resources.

#### 1.5 Project management and administration

The DPAB has successfully and transparently implemented the 'Organizational Development for Sustainability' project. All activities were carried out in accordance with the plans and programmes that had been approved. Other than budget reallocation for output 2.1: Employment opportunities for disabled individuals, no significant deviations were observed. Due to the imposition of two lockdowns following the outbreak of the COVID-19 pandemic, the activity was cancelled. Budget has been reallocated to ICT training, which is also one of the project's key outputs. The project management team completed the project on time and kept the Board of Trustees informed of progress during quarterly meetings. Additionally, the management team reported to the Donor on the progress and shortcomings on an annual basis. The project is audited annually by the Royal Audit Authority, as mandated by the law of the land.

Four additional bylaws and papers were drafted to govern and advise the DPAB in carrying out its mandates and providing services in a transparent and efficient way. DPAB revised its Article of Association in 2020, produced and adopted internal service rules, financial rules and regulations, and a strategic plan.

There are no adverse findings in the annual audit reports. The report demonstrates that the project adhered to applicable statutory law and the organization's bylaws. The table below shows the total budget proposed and received from the project:

Budget	2019	2020	2021	Total
Projected Budget	4,967,720.00	4,997,720.00	5,077,720.00	15,043,160.00
Budget Received	4,948,476.00	5,403,614.93	5,390,600.00	15,742,690.93
Programme Expenses	2,661,759.00	2,801,295.00	2,678,000.00	8,141,054.00
Operational Expenses	2,226,002.00	2,327,320.00	2,712,600.00	7,265,922.00
Percentage of operational expenses	44.98	43.07	50.32	46.15

# Q8: To what extent does DPAB's capacity match the selected project objectives and strategy. To what extend have DPAB recruited and engaged volunteer workers in the organization?

DPAB is a small CSO with a staff of six people led by an Executive Director. PWD make up the lion's share of the workforce, with four of them employed by the organisation. The Board of Trustees and Technical Committee Members provide direction to the management. Staff members are multitasking and are responsible for the majority of the tasks.

In addition to its existing staff, the DPAB relied on volunteers. Throughout the three-year project's duration, the organisation engaged a total of 10 volunteers in 2019, averaging 120 estimated hours per volunteer, and 27 volunteers in 2020, averaging 120 estimated hours per volunteer. Volunteer engagement appears to be extremely effective in a variety of ways. To begin, the organisation is able to obtain human resources for free. Second, volunteers gain an understanding of the organisation and the needs and priorities of people with disabilities. Finally, they become an inadvertent ambassador for the organisation, assisting in the creation of advocacy in larger society.

Q 9: Assess the effects and results of staff development training. Assess the monitoring and evaluation system. Is the project achieving results effectively? Is data collected on the selected indicators for the project outcomes and outputs? Do these indicators provide adequate evidence to verify performance? Is it necessary to collect additional data?

Given the organization's mandates and duties, as well as its limited human resources, training programmes are deemed vital for the office's effective operation and project implementation. Over the duration of the project, the initiative could enhance the ability of DPAB's staff and interns in a range of areas, including leadership, ICT, accounting, office administration, and organisational skills. The staff is now more capable of carrying out DPAB's mandates as an autonomous entity. At the very least, DPAB staff now have a basic understanding of how to formulate a project proposal, approach donors, and implement the project. This ability is vital and indispensable for DPAB officials due to the institution's donor reliance.

Monitoring and evaluation was found to be done in line with the monitoring and evaluation plan spelled out in the project document. The project management team collected and maintained data based the data flowchart. The management has collected data for respective indicators in order to validate the outcome and output of the project. The data for the indicators can be found in the donor's annual reports, which were submitted towards the end of the year. While the annual report contained all required information, the report's format was found to be inconsistent. The summary of the specific result for Normisjon's Global Result-Based Management framework is found to be inconsistent with the approved project's logical framework. If the report had used a logical framework for presenting the summary

of specific results, it would have been much easier for the implementing organisation and donor agency to comprehend the project's progress.

#### **1.6** Empowerment assessment

Empowerment assessment was done based on five major thematic areas namely Strengthening civil society; sustained DPAB as an institution; empowered PWDs; Improved attitude and values of the society towards PWDs, and Gender equality. The empowerment assessment was done based on the EAT-E Empowerment assessment Tool-C of Digni. The definitions of the level and characteristics are based on the assessment tool. The empowerment outcomes of respective thematic areas are as represented in the assessment table below.

	DEGREE AND LEVEL OF EMPOWERMENT					
		Level 1: Output	Level 2:	Level 3:	Level 4: Outcome	Level 5: Impact
ILT			Output	Outcome		
RESULT		Individual or			Community and/	Community/Socie
OF R		community	Individual or	Individual or	or society	ty/Structural
AS O			community	community		
AREAS	1. Strengthening Civil Society				X	
THEMATIC	2. Quality Education				X	
THEN	3. Gender Equality				Х	

- 1. Strengthening Civil Society: According to the EAT empowerment evaluation methodology, empowerment for the purpose of strengthening Civil Society is a Level 4 outcome. It is scored at this level because the society strives to make Bhutan an inclusive society and to increase the participation of persons with disabilities in decision-making. The acceptance of the National Policy for Persons with Disabilities by the government demonstrates this. DPAB has been able to raise financial resources through membership fee contributions from the society. Local communities are capable of recognising and assisting individuals with disabilities. DPAB has been recognized as Persons with disabilities's Organization in Bhutan by UN Bhutan.
- 2. Quality Education: The achievement level for education of high quality has been assigned to outcome level 4. The project has provided financial assistance to PWDs who are unable to pay for their own education. Bhutan is committed to providing a high-quality education and to providing it free of charge to its inhabitants. Bhutan's Constitution mandates that all children get free education. The central school concept effort increases access, equity, quality, system efficiency, and sustainability in the delivery of educational services in society. Bhutan has Special Education Requirements (SEN) schools dedicated to the needs of people with disabilities.
- 3. Gender Equality: For gender equality, an outcome level of 4 has been awarded. Gender equality has been a priority throughout the project, ensuring that opportunities are available to all, regardless of gender. Male and female beneficiaries were almost equally likely to take advantage of the chances and also engage in the project's implementation, as evidenced by the beneficiary count. Additionally, the society has a specific organisation for women and children empowerment, the National Commission for Women and Children.

#### 1.7 Sustainability Assessment

The institution's sustainability was determined using the DPAB's human resource capabilities, financial resources, and political will. From a human resources standpoint, DPAB is a relatively tiny and compact organisation, with only six full-time employees, including the Executive Director. Despite the enormity of the obligations, the staff is small, with the majority of employees being PWD. Given the organization's sheer size, it should have employees with a broad range of talents capable of performing a variety of jobs. The review determined that the project was successful in developing employees' skills and capability in a variety of areas crucial to the organization's survival. Recognizing its financial obligations, the company implemented cross-cutting measures and made optimal use of existing workers. Existing employees performed a variety of tasks, ranging from day-to-day office operations to lobbying, advocacy, and training programmes, as well as report and documentation preparation and programming. The organisation now has a well-trained workforce who are always prepared to carry out the organization's mission. Taking into account the human capacities, it is determined that they will operate and sustain DPAB as a DPO.

Another critical area for organisational survival is financial resources. The DPAB was a donor-supported organisation that received all of its money from donors, including for operational expenses. The DPAB was assisted by the project in conducting a membership fee drive. The DPAB could register 2521 contributing members throughout a three-year period. These individuals make a monthly contribution of at least Nu.100. As a result, the organisation may be able to raise some amount of money through the membership fee drive, thereby gaining financial leverage. The DPAB was able to maintain some saving in Bhutan Development Bank Limited for its sustenance. The amount is, however, modest in relation to monthly operational expenses. According to the DPAB's financial statements, it does not have a reserve fund or government financing support. The DPAB has been unable to build the resource centre as originally envisioned in the project proposal. The DPAB was able to develop a business plan for the resource centre. If DPAB had built the centre, it would have benefited the organisation in generating revenue sufficient to cover operating expenses. It is worth noting that the Gross National Happiness Commission has decided in principle to include the construction of the Resource Centre in the 13th Five-Year Plan. Government assistance for the resource centre's construction would have a profound effect on DPAB's sustainability. Nonetheless, the organisation has made important policy advancements. The DPAB was successful in persuading the government for the National Disability Policy's adoption. Additionally, the DPAB was able to design and approve the organization's strategy.

Withdrawing support from Normisjon would leave the organisation with a large financial hole. This is due to the organization's inability to build a business centre. The membership price paid is small in comparison to the operational costs. Additionally, the DPAB has not

been awarded any government support. Even if the government is willing to help the DPAB financially, it will require time until the start of the 13th five-year plan in 2023. As a result, it is critical for DPAB to begin searching for a donor immediately and continue doing so until 2023. Obtaining extra two years of support from a donor would allow for a smooth transition to self-sufficiency.

#### Q 10: What decisions has to be made in order for the organization to service?

Recognizing the threat to financial sustainability, the organisation must aggressively pursue membership growth. Bhutanese are naturally compassionate and generous. Individuals are not opposed to contributing a small amount to a worthy cause. Contributing to the empowerment of PWDs is a worthy cause, and people will gladly contribute. DPAB must make an attempt to reach a broader segment of the population.

DPAB must strengthen the program division. Success of the organization is contingent to proactiveness and capacity of the program division. As the organization being donor driven agency must reenforce the program division and vigorously concentrate on looking for donors. The organization would be able to at least support empowerment programs through donor projects. DPAB must attempt to recruit well qualified and experienced officials in the division and capitalize on their competence in securing vibrant projects both from within and outside country.

# Q 11: To what extent DPAB needs to or need not reduce its activity? If yes, which of the activities needs to be dropped and which personnel/positions and operational costs has to be reduced?

i. The end of Normisjon support would almost certainly mean the end of DPAB. The organisation will be unable to cover its operational costs, let alone provide mandatory support and rehabilitation. DPAB must definitively discontinue financial-

resource-intensive programmes. Rehabilitation and support programmes, such as education scholarships and medical assistance, may be suspended temporarily while the organisation seeks funding.

- ii. The organisation may also suspend advocacy activities for a time, given the organization's vigorous efforts to raise awareness among various segments of society, including parliamentarians, bureaucrats, local government leaders, educators, students, and the general public. However, the organisation may use multimedia in social media platforms without incurring financial costs. On the DPAB's website and social media platforms, the DPAB may post pertinent documentaries and video clips
- iii. Almost half of the project's budget was spent on operational costs. However, there is no ways to reduce it given the inflation of utilities and limited manpower. The organisation currently employs only six people, which is insignificant in comparison to the organization's massive mandates. Rather than that, the organization's programme section should be strengthened through the hire of an experienced programme manager to assure continuous donor funding. DPAB will be able to perform optimally if it is sufficiently staffed in accordance with the organisational structure. The framework necessitates the appointment of legal and research staff. These sections are critical in light of DPAB's recent upgrading to DPO status and the worldwide environment requirement.

#### 3. Lessons learned

Execution of the organizational development for sustainability was all learning for the staff and organization. Besides many important lessons, the DPAB was able to learn following lessons while executing the project.

i. The pandemic showed on the importance of having backup plans/contingency plans in case of emergency. DPAB could never have imagined that such a pandemic would strike the world and wreak havoc on everything. Everyone was taken aback when the COVID-19 pandemic broke out across the country in 2020. Frequent lockdowns, restrictions on social gatherings, and restrictions on trainings and workshops all hampered the project's progress significantly. However, the pandemic has had no effect on DPAB's ability to complete the project's objectives. DPAB was innovative enough to employ novel approaches,

particularly in the advocacy programme. DPAB opted for a virtual advocacy programme rather than the more traditional faceto-face advocacy approach. DPAB was successful in generating advocacy through national television broadcasts of documentaries/multimedia. The method was commendable in that it provided greater coverage at a low cost. Following the pandemic, the DPAB recognised the critical nature of having a contingency plan in place in the event of a national calamity. DPAB must ensure that future projects have disaster contingency plans.

**ii.** The project taught DPAB the lesson on the importance of Empowering employees in the organization by making them accountable for everything. Leaned to instil courage in employees to accept both failure and success with Normisjon thereby promoting humility in the employees.

#### 4. Recommendations

- **i.** DPAB should temporarily cease its advocacy effort in light of its great progress to date and instead focus on other critical concerns such as financial sustainability in light of financial constraints.
- **ii.** Given the organization's infancy and limited manpower, it is vital that the organisation continue to rely on volunteers to carry out its mandates. The organisation should consider utilising volunteer knowledge on a pro gratis basis.
- iii. DPAB's programme division should be strengthened in order to secure further projects and donor funds. Financial assistance is crucial for the survival of an organisation. DPAB may even consider hiring an experienced programme manager and concentrating on project proposal preparation.
- **iv.** DPAB's rehabilitation and empowerment activities may be suspended until donor financing is secured. At the moment, the organisation is unable to cover its operational costs, let alone the costs associated with empowerment.
- v. DPAB must encourage the government to expedite the adoption of the national policy for persons with disabilities. Implementation of the policy will assure the implementation of DPAB empowerment initiatives, as the policy incorporates most of the empowerment programmes of DPAB. However, DPAB may provide domain expertise to the government while implementing the policy.

- vi. One of the most important tasks for the DPAB is to ensure its financial viability and develop a long-term strategy. Despite the fact that the group has at least begun to receive some cash from the membership fee, the amount is insignificant when compared to the organization's massive operational costs. Even if the other programmes are funded, the company will be unable to cover its operations costs with its own revenue.
- vii. The construction of resource centre would have been the primary focus of the project in the light of organization's sustainability. A more efficient approach would have focused just on the two primary components: operating expenses and construction of the Resource Centre. One-time investment of this size would have enabled the DPAB to generate revenue while also serving as an example of an accessible building in the country. In the future, DPAB will have to prepare and request funding for the development of a resource centre from any potential donors. Construction of Resource Centre would be a critical area of funding for future donors.
- viii. Given the organization's massive operational expenses, lack of reserve funds, and internal revenue, it is recommended that DPAB continue to seek funding for future projects as a package of operational expenses until the organisation can construct a resource centre or establish a reliable revenue stream.

#### 5. List of References

- 1. Persons with disabilities's Organization of Bhutan Nothing about us without us. (n.d.). Retrieved January 10, 2022, from https://dpobhutan.com/
- National Policy for Persons with Disabilities, 2019 Gross National Happiness Commission. (n.d.-a). Retrieved January 10, 2022, from https://www.gnhc.gov.bt/en/national-policy-for-persons-with-disabilities-2019/
- 3. National Policy for Persons with Disabilities, 2019 Gross National Happiness Commission. (n.d.-b). Retrieved January 10, 2022, from https://www.gnhc.gov.bt/en/national-policy-for-persons-with-disabilities-2019/
- 4. The Constitution of The Kingdom of Bhutan. (n.d.). https://www.gov.bt/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/Constitution-of-Bhutan-Eng-2008.pdf?x50504
- 5. Twelfth Five Year Plan. (n.d.). https://www.gnhc.gov.bt/en/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/TWELVE-FIVE-YEAR-WEB-VERSION.pdf
- 6. Project Agreement between Disabled Persons Association of Bhutan and Normisjon
- 7. Annual Report for Organizational Development for Sustainability 2019 and 2020
- Annual Audit Report on the Accounts and Operation of the NORAD Financed Project No: 10764- "Organizational Development for Sustainability' 2019 and 2020
- 9. Audit Report on the Accounts and Operation of the Disable Person's Association of Bhutan 2019 and 2020
- 10. Terms of Reference for 2021 Final Evaluation of Organizational Development for Sustainability.
- 11. Baseline of Oganizational Development for Sustainability: 3 Year Phase-Out Period
- 12. Sustainable Development Goals.
- 13. Population and Housing Census of Bhutan (PHCB) 2017.

## 6. Annexures

### Annexure I: Project Activity Result

Expected Results (Outcome and Outputs)	Indicators	Result achieved and status	Means of verification
OUTCOME 1	: Sustained DPAB as an instit	ution	
OUTPUT:1. 1 Capacity of DPAB strengthened	50% of operational expenses met through revenue generated by DPAB	<b>Status: Partially completed</b> DPAB has been able to generate some revenue through membership fee contribution campaign and donation. The organization as of 31 <sup>st</sup> December 2021 has raised a total of Nu. 6201771.74 through membership fee and donations and the amount has been put in the saving account with Bhutan Development Bank Limited and Bank of Bhutan Limited.	Administrative report and records, audit report, financial report, Bank Statement
Suchguiched	6 DPAB staff trained	Status:CompletedAll staff and interns trained on various field such asleadership, ICT, Accounting System, Office management,organizational skills, etc.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team

	100% Strategy plan for goal	Status: Completed	Administrative report
and sustainability of DPAB		Strategic Plan of DPAB was developed and endorsed by the	and records, audit
	developed	Board of Trustees and UN Bhutan Office.	report, project team
		Status: Completed	
	50 PWDs engaged as	51 PWDs were engaged in advocacy and awareness	Administrative report
	representatives of DPAB in	programs such as Disability Equality Training, Self	and records, audit
	outreach and advocacy work	Advocacy programs, and TOT for Disability Equality	report, project team
		Training	
OUTPUT:1.			
2			
Membership		Status: Completed	A 1
developed to	300 permanent contributing	DPAB registered 2521 contributing members. A member	Administrative report
gain an	members registered	contributes minimum of Nu. 100 per month and their membership	and records, audit
income from		duration varies from one to two years.	report, project team
membership			
fees.			
OUTPUT:1.		Status: Completed	Administrative report
3 Resource	1 Business Plan developed	Architectural drawing for resource centre developed and submitted	and records, audit
Centre Built		to various agencies for funding. However, the construction is still	report, project team
		due and looking funding.	
OUTCOME:28			

OUTPUT:2. 1 Persons with disabilities are employed.	30 PWDs employed in various organizations through the support of the government.	<b>Status: Completed</b> A total of 57 PWDs were employed in various agencies. Of 57 PWDs, 17 PWDs were employed in different agencies while 40 PWDs got self employed by becoming entrepreneurs after undergoing entrepreneurship training.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team
OUTPUT 2.2 Rehabilitatio n programme at the	30 PWDs availed medical support in three years through the support of the government.	Status: Partially completed The project targeted to provide medical support to 30 PWDs. However, only 22 PWDS availed medical support. The achievement of the target is not attributed to the project. Rather, the target is contingent to need and situation of PWDs. Moreover, the budget for the last year for the activity was also reduced by the donor.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team
at the community level strengthened.	120 PWDs availed education support in the Central schools with the support of the government.	<b>Status: Partially Completed</b> The project aimed to provide education support in the central schools to 120 PWDs in three year's time. However, the project provided support to 97 PWDs in three year's time. Currently, there are 28 PWDs availing education support in the central schools.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team
OUTPUT 2.3 Women and men with	30 women and men with disabilities trained on life	<b>Status: Completed</b> 66 men and women trained on life skills with the support from various stakeholders.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team

disabilities	skills with the support from		
trained on life	various stakeholders.		
skills			
OUTCOME:3 In	nproved attitude and values of the	society towards Persons with disabilities	
OUTPUT:			
3.1 Society			
and persons with		Status: Completed	
disabilities informed on the rights/needs of persons with disabilities	15 awareness workshop and trainings conducted	A total of 32 awareness workshops and trainings were conducted targeting to parliamentarians, bureaucrats, LG leaders, educationist and intuitions, public transporters, etc. on the rights and needs of PWDs and DPAB as DPO.	Administrative report and records, audit report, project team
OUTPUT:3.			
2 Local	900 Local Government	Status: Completed	
government	Leaders trained on	A total of 2712 local government leaders and participants	Administrative report
leaders	Inclusiveness and	were trained and sensitized on inclusiveness and	and records, audit
trained on	participation of PWDs in	participation of persons with disabilities in the development	report, project team
inclusiveness	development process	process. (Figure excludes data of 2021)	
and			

Participation		
of persons		
with		
disabilities in		
development		
process		

#### **Annexure II: Terms of Reference (TOR)**

#### 2021 Final Evaluation of the Organizational Development Project

of

#### **Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan (DPAB)**

#### **1. BACKGROUND INFORMATION**

Persons with disabilities's Organization (DPO), erstwhile Disabled Persons' Association of Bhutan (DPAB), was founded by a group of persons with disabilities to recognize the voice of our own. It is legally registered with the Civil Society Organizations Authority (CSOA) on 26<sup>th</sup> November 2010 under the Royal Patronage of His Royal Highness Prince Namgyal Wangchuck, the XXVI<sup>th</sup> Paro Penlop. With the vision to be 'an inclusive society that recognizes, respects and promotes the rights and needs of all persons with disabilities in Bhutan,' DPAB aspires to 'promote the physical, psychological, and socio-economic well-being of persons with disabilities through inclusion and empowerment.'

The organization is governed by a Board of Trustees, whose members are elected from among members of the organization for a fixed term of office. DPAB has seven Board members and fifteen Technical Members. There are twenty-five Focal Persons (DT Secretaries in Dzongkhags) who support DPAB with the data update of persons with disabilities of their respective districts, supporting coordination and communication at the Dzongkhag level whenever needed.

In the management team, there are six staff, who oversee the day-to-day functions of the organization. Persons with disabilities's Organization is the only DPAB in the country with persons with disabilities playing an active role as Board Members, Technical Members, and the Management Team. The Association's functioning is guided by its charter and the Articles of Association, as per the requirement of the Civil Society Organization Act 2007. Financial transactions and performance of the Association are subject to external auditing and scrutiny by the board and donors.

The objectives of DPAB are to:

Function as a platform to represent all persons with disabilities in policy formulation, legislation, and programs that impact the lives of persons with disabilities.

Raise awareness and advocate for the rights of persons with disabilities in Bhutan.

Create opportunities for persons with disabilities to realize the potentials and abilities to lead a meaningful life.

Enhance the capacity of persons with disabilities through life-long learning.

Improve the quality of life and living conditions of persons with disabilities.

Empower persons with disabilities through employment, effective participation, and decisionmaking and

Facilitate communication, coordination, and collaboration with relevant organizations within and outside the country.

As the central organization between the Government and beneficiaries at large, DPAB is creating opportunities for persons with disabilities by raising our own voices and at the same time lobbying with the government for support. Ever since its inception, the DPAB's main task has been to educate the general populace about the rights of persons with disabilities and to lobby with the government of the day for support to beneficiaries. Further, DPAB's significant contribution has been in alleviating many of the persons with disabilities from poverty to Normisjon through skill-based programs and education.

#### **Project Description**

Four years after the organizational inception, DPAB was granted support for a 5-year Organizational Development Project (2014-2018) by Normisjon. Subsequent to successful execution of the project, the Normisjon was generous enough to extend the project by another 3 years i.e., 2019 -2021. Project goals and components are as mentioned below:

#### **Project Development Goal:**

DPAB is a financially sustained institution with a competent staff that promotes physical,

psychological and socio-economic well-being of persons with disabilities through

inclusion and empowerment.

## **Project Objective:**

DPAB is a sustainable institution.

People with disabilities are empowered.

Attitude and values of the society towards person with disabilities are improved.

## **Project Output:**

Capacity of DPAB strengthened

Resource and coordination centre established for persons with disabilities

Membership developed to gain an income from membership fees.

Persons with disabilities are employed.

Women and men with disabilities are trained on life skills.

Rehabilitation programmes at the community level strengthened

Society and persons with disabilities informed on the rights/needs of persons with disabilities.

Local government leaders trained on inclusiveness and Participation of persons with disabilities in development process.

# 2. PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

The main purposes of this final evaluation are to:

create a learning process that will bring out valuable information for the DPAB to improve effectiveness of future strategies and programs.

ii. evaluate the project's level of performance and progress towards its specified development goals and objectives.

develop the organizational capacities of DPAB by gaining an understanding of its current strengths and challenges.

ascertain the extent to which the influence and development generated by the initiative would likely remain when external donor funding has ceased.

determine the efficiency with which resources are utilised.

assess the level of empowerment.

assess the organization's sustainability in the event that Normisjon funding ceases.

# 3. FOCUS AREAS OF EVALUATION

The focus of this evaluation will be to assess the project's relevance and the strategy in light of the project's achievements, progress, constraints and future scope of the following programme components:

DPAB as a sustained institution.

Empowering persons with disabilities.

Improving attitudes and values of the society towards persons with disabilities.

# 4. EVALUATION QUESTIONS

The evaluation team should, to the highest extent possible, provide responses to the following research questions:

## A. Overall project design

Have the outcomes, outputs and activities of the programme been consistent with the project strategy and the intended impacts of the project Has the project achieved its desired outcomes? Has it contributed to change in people's lives?

What are the major factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of project objectives? Has the project contributed to learning?

# **B.** Project activities

To what extent has DPAB's awareness and advocacy efforts contributed to raise awareness and influence the situation of PWD in Bhutan?

How has the project contributed to organizational development of DPAB?

To what extend the support and rehabilitation effort enhance livelihood and independence of persons with disabilities in the society;

To what extent has DPAB managed to generate income and attract funding from other supporters and donors.

#### C. Project management and administration

Assess the overall management of the project, including finance control, operating routines, transparency and planning and reporting, and consider whether human and monetary resources are used according to approved plans and in line with internal rules and regulations of DPAB.

Assess the working capacity of DPAB. To what extent does DPAB's capacity match the selected project objectives and strategy. To what extend have DPAB recruited and engaged volunteer workers in the organization?

Assess the effects and results of staff development training. Assess the monitoring and evaluation system. Is the project achieving results effectively? Is data collected on the selected indicators for the project outcomes and outputs? Do these indicators provide adequate evidence to verify performance? Is it necessary to collect additional data?

#### **D.** Empowerment assessment

Based on the information collected through project document, from target groups and project' partner staff, the external evaluator will assess the degree of empower achievement as per the Normisjon's Empowerment Assessment Tool.

#### E. Sustainability Assessment

The external evaluator will assess the sustainability of the organization based on the income and operational costs including salaries as of today. The evaluator must examine and recommend what will happen when the fund from Normisjon no longer comes. What decisions has to be made in order for the organization to service? To what extent DPAB needs to or need not reduce its activity? If yes, which of the activities needs to be dropped and which personnel/positions and operational costs has to be reduced?

#### 5. RECOMMENDATIONS AND LESSONS LEARNED

The evaluation team is requested to reflect on DPAB's future role and function, given the capacity, objective and frame of this project. The evaluation team will also investigate alternatives and provide recommendations on measures to ensure sustainability and effective realization of the project goal.

In addition, the evaluation team will give minimum two recommendations for each category (A, B, C, D, and E) under point 3 above. To ensure an optimal application for the project, all recommendations should be clear and practical and take into consideration the available capacity and resources in this project

# 6. METHODOLOGY

The evaluation will provide quantitative and qualitative data through the following methods:

- i. Discussion Session/Meeting with the DPAB Management, Executive Committee, Advisory Committee and Board.
- ii. Qualitative interviews with key informants, other stakeholders (implementing partners, cooperating governmental/private institutions,)
- iii. Focus Group Discussions with beneficiaries
- iv. Review of relevant documents/reports/publications (project documents, annual work plans, progress reports, annual reports and reports of the board, etc.)

## 7. EVALUATION TEAM

The final evaluation will be carried out by an external independent consultant having below detailed qualifications.

The Consultant will possess a minimum of a bachelor's degree with strong background in participatory evaluation of development programs. Specifically, the consultant should have proven experience and skills in the following areas:

- 2 years' experience in conducting program evaluations;
- Sound knowledge and practical experience in program development, planning and implementation in the area of organizational development;
- Extensive research and analytical skills;
- Excellent writing and oral communication;
- Facilitation and management skills;
- Possess leadership skills and be a team player;
- Knowledge of persons with disability.

# 8. BUDGET AN PRACTICAL ARRANGMENTS

Budget frame is set to BTN 150,000. Details hereunder:

Activity	Proposed Budget	Remarks
Consultancy Fee	100,000.00	
Daily Allowance/Travel Allowance	35,000.00	
Stationeries	10,000.00	
Miscellaneous Expenses	5,000.00	
Total	150,000.00	

# 9. TIMEFRAME, SUBMISSION OF REPORT

The Final Evaluation will commence on 1<sup>st</sup> November 2021 and complete within 30 days from the date of start. The Draft Evaluation Report will be submitted to DPAB by 1<sup>st</sup> December 2021 and circulated to Normisjon and other stakeholders for feedback and response. The Final Evaluation Report will ready by 15<sup>th</sup> December 2021.

# Table 1: Work Plan for Final Evaluation of the Organizational Development of Persons with disabilities's Bhutan

Date	Activity	Expected Outcome	Input s	Stakeh older
01 – 07 Dec. 2021	Literature review	Obtained general overview of the DPAB and its projects	DPAB Web, Annua 1 Repor t, availa ble docu ments	Consul tant
08 Dec. 2021	Meeting with DPAB Officials	Consulted and agreed by DPAB on the following: - Terms of Reference - Evaluation methodology and plan - Stakeholders identified - Project sites identified for visit	Intera ction	DPAB & Consul tant
09-13 Dec. 2021	Desk review	Financial Progress reviewed Physical progress reviewed Policy and legal progress reviewed	Annua l Repor ts Relev ant	Consul tant support ed by DPAB

			Docu ments Legal and policy docu ments	project team
14-16 Nov. 2021	Conduct situational Analysis	Visited project sites Met project beneficiaries Consulted relevant stakeholders	Site visits Intera ction	DPAB Consul tant Stakeh olders
17 – 21 Dec. 2021	Draft inception report	Overview of the evaluation report framework drawn	Com ments and feedba ck receiv ed from the above meeti ngs and site visits	Consul tant
22 Dec. 2021	Present inception report to the DPAB project team	Received comments, feedbacks and suggestions	Intera ction	DPAB &

			Consul tant
23 - 25 Dec. 2021	Draft evaluation report	Drafted final evaluation report	Consul tant
26 Dec. 2021	Present Draft evaluation report to the DPAB team	Evaluation report consulted and endorsed by the DPAB officials	DPAB Consul tant
28 Dec. 2021	Submit the draft report to Nomisjons	The draft evaluation report reviewed and feedback received from the Donor	
31 Dec. 2021	Submission of the final evaluation report	Final report submitted to DPAB	Consul tant